Discussion of "Changes in Racial Gaps in Retirement Security over Time" by Karen Dynan and Douglas Elmendorf

Dubravka Ritter Senior Advisor and Research Fellow Consumer Finance Institute Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia

This presentation and my remarks are my views only, not necessarily those of the Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia or the Federal Reserve System.

Summary

Everything came together:

- Important question
 - Trends and racial gaps in retirement security
 - Focus on vulnerable families
- Helpful data source in PSID
 - Wealth of data on wealth (pun intended)
 - Oversampling of low-income and Black households
 - Longitudinal (and intergenerational) data
- Careful methodology
 - Role of consequential, understudied assets
 - Sophisticated imputations of missing retirement assets and improved estimates of income replacement rates in retirement

Context and Contribution

- Holistic view of retirement security
 - \rightarrow Incorporate Social Security and defined benefits plans
 - Retirement security as distinct from retirement savings
 - Asset categories are somewhat fungible
 - People rely on retirement savings for various purposes well before retirement
- Distinct factors affect different pockets of the population

→ Important implications for understanding racial disparities
 → Important implications for policy

- Dorothy Brown's *The Whiteness of Wealth* (2022) fantastic resource on contemporaneous systemic factors for wealth gaps:
 - Seemingly racially neutral tax policies \rightarrow disparate impact
 - Occupational segregation (employer retirement benefits)
- Relates to recent work (Althoff and Reichert, 2022) on institutionalized racial oppression and the persistence of the wealth gap

- Educational support for children (other family support?)
 - Much higher rates/amounts of borrowing for Black parents
 - Preventing accumulation and/or draining existing assets
 - Financial aid system protects home equity and retirement assets
 → more grant funding for white kids (Levine and Ritter, 2022)
 - Particularly relevant in top half of income distribution
- Bequests! Aubry, Munnell, and Wettstein (2023)
- Decomposition of contributing factors by race, over time

Discussion of "Wills, Wealth, and Race" by Jean-Pierre Aubry, Alicia Munnell, and Gal Wettstein

Dubravka Ritter Consumer Finance Institute Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia

This presentation and my remarks are my views only, not necessarily those of the Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia or the Federal Reserve System.



Summary

- Part of a more ambitious three-part study on the effectiveness of wills as a policy tool
- Highlights important nuances and racial implications of the bequest patterns and process
- Significant racial disparities in:
 - inheritance receipt
 - estate planning
 - inheritance realizations
 - \rightarrow Will as a potential mechanism that affects bequests
- Important insights and questions as a standalone project
- Consequential ingredients for next steps of the project, both experimental design and potential policy solutions

Context and Contribution

- Outstanding review of the state of the literature and institutional detail
- Builds on earlier work on importance of intergenerational wealth transfers in asset building
 - 20%? 80%? somewhere in between?
 - What exactly is a transfer?
 - \rightarrow Informs how much attention is warranted
- Will as a potential mechanism for increasing bequests
 - Guard against complicated probate circumstances
 - Behavioral effects

- What share of the bequests are actually these "complex" situations that might be aided by a will?
 - \rightarrow What share of racial disparities can be explained?
- Behavioral effects → experimental design
 - Literature on "nudge" or "shove"
 - Salience? E.g. Blascak et al (2021)

- Ruling out confounding factors potentially correlated with race:
 - Housing wealth?
 - Flow income? Especially Social Security? Dynan and Elmendorf (2023)
 - Health and chances of meeting expectations?
 - Time between last interview and death?

 \rightarrow Inspiration from fair lending methods

• Instrument for wills? State/local probate laws? Hospital practices?