Reorienting Retirement Risk Management

EDITED BY

Robert L. Clark
and Olivia S. Mitchell

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Preface

How can we find new ways to identify and then successfully manage the risks associated with retirement saving and dissaving? In the aftermath of the global financial crisis, it is becoming ever clearer that more must be done to enhance financial knowledge and financial education. Employers, employees, and other institutions – including governments – must play a more proactive role in this process. At the same time, new financial products will be required to help retirement plans innovate in the financing arena. This volume identifies ways to enhance retirement risk management so as to offset some of the uncertainty surrounding retirement saving, build more assets for retirement, better fund retirement plans, and help manage assets during the payout phase.

In the process of preparing this book, several key people and institutions played essential roles. Excellent editorial help was provided by my coeditor Robert Clark, a capable partner and colleague in research and development. On behalf of the Council, I thank him along with all the contributors to the book, the many reviewers who helped bring this work to fruition, and the PRC Advisory Board on whom we rely for guidance. We are also grateful for the intellectual and financial sustenance provided by our Senior Partners and the Institutional Members of the Pension Research Council, listed elsewhere in this volume. The Wharton School graciously provided access to conference facilities and more through its Impact Conference funding. Additional financial support was received from the Pension Research Council, the Boettner Center for Pensions and Retirement Research, and the Ralph H. Blanchard Memorial Endowment at the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania. The manuscript was expertly prepared and carefully edited by Matthew Rosen and Andrew Gallagher, with oversight and direction from Hilary Farrell.

Our work at the Pension Research Council and the Boettner Center of the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania has focused on aspects of pensions and retirement security for more than 50 years. This fine volume will be a welcome addition to the libraries of all concerned with retirement security.

Olivia S. Mitchell

Executive Director, Pension Research Council
Director, Boettner Center for Pensions and Retirement Research
The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania
## Contents

Preface v  
List of Figures ix  
List of Tables xi  
Notes on Contributors xiii  
List of Abbreviations xix  

1. The Evolution of Retirement Risk Management  
   Robert L. Clark and Olivia S. Mitchell  
   1

   **Part I: Revisiting Retirement Saving and Dissaving Advice**

2. Retirement Saving Adequacy and Individual Investment Risk Management Using the Asset/Salary Ratio  
   P. Brett Hammond and David P. Richardson  
   13

3. Employer-Provided Retirement Planning Programs  
   Robert L. Clark, Melinda S. Morrill, and Steven G. Allen  
   36

4. How Does Retirement Planning Software Handle Postretirement Realities?  
   Anna M. Rappaport and John A. Turner  
   65

5. Impact of the Pension Protection Act on Financial Advice: What Works and What Remains to Be Done?  
   Lynn Pettus and R. Hall Kesmodel, Jr.  
   86

   **Part II The Environment for Retirement Plan Redesign**

6. The Effect of Uncertain Labor Income and Social Security on Life-Cycle Portfolios  
   Raimond Maurer, Olivia S. Mitchell, and Ralph Rogalla  
   107

7. The Declining Role of Private Defined Benefit Pension Plans: Who Is Affected, and How  
   Craig Copeland and Jack VanDerhei  
   122
Contents

   Damon Silvers 137

9. Longevity Risk and Annuities in Singapore
   Joelie H. Y. Fong, Olivia S. Mitchell, and Benedict S. K. Koh 156

Part III Innovations in Retirement Risk Financing

10. Outsourcing Pension Longevity Protection
    Igor Balevich 179

11. Comparing Spending Approaches in Retirement
    John Ameriks, Michael Hess, and Liqian Ren 198

12. Risk Budgeting for the Canadian Pension Plan Investment Board
    Sterling Gunn and Tracy Livingstone 217

13. Can VEBAs Alleviate Retiree Health-Care Problems?
    Aaron Bernstein 241

End Pages 265
Index 269
List of Figures

Figure 2.1 Personal funding ratios for 30–80% replacement rate (RR) targets 18
Figure 2.2 Average asset/salary ratio (ASR) by age 21
Figure 2.3 Average asset/salary ratio (ASR) by age and sex 22
Figure 2.4 Average asset/salary ratio (ASR) by tenure 23
Figure 2.5 Average asset/salary ratio (ASR) by tenure and sex 24
Figure 2.6 Average asset/salary ratio (ASR) by contribution rate 25
Figure 2.7 Average asset/salary ratio (ASR) by contribution rate and source 26
Figure 3.1 Knowledge score before and after seminar. 46
Figure 3.2 Change in knowledge score before and after seminar. Panel A: All participants. Panel B: Arrayed by knowledge before seminar 47
Figure 6.1 Life-cycle asset allocation patterns: low labor income risk and high social security replacement rate 110
Figure 6.2 Liquid assets and saving rates for low versus high labor income risk levels and high versus low social security replacement rates. Panel A: Liquid assets. Panel B: Saving rates 112
Figure 6.3 Life-cycle asset allocation for low versus high labor income risk levels and high versus low social security replacement rates. Panel A: Equity weights. Panel B: Bond weights. Panel C: Annuity weights 114
Figure 7.1 Percentage of Americans age 65 or older with pension and annuity income, by income quintile; 1974–2007 124
Figure 7.2 Expected reduction in nominal replacement ratios if all private defined benefit (DB) plans were to freeze accruals for new employees immediately, by sex and age 131
Figure 7.3 Expected conditional reduction in nominal replacement ratios if all private DB plans were to freeze accruals for new employees immediately, by sex and age 131
Figure 7.4 Percentage of those with ‘lost’ defined benefit (DB) wealth due to a pension freeze expected to have a larger total nominal replacement rate from the enhanced defined contributions (DC) (if any) 132
x  List of Figures

Figure 7.5  Median percentage of compensation required as an enhanced employer contribution for future years covered by a defined contribution (DC) plan in lieu of a frozen defined benefit (DB) plan for financial indemnification 133

Figure 9.1  Cumulative cohort survival probability: general population and annuitant groups (conditional on attaining age 55 and limiting age of 117, 2007). Panel A: Singaporean males. Panel B: Singaporean females 165

Figure 10.1  United States life expectancy at birth (period table) 181
Figure 10.2  Ratio of RP-2000 combined healthy mortality rates to 2000 US population mortality rates 183
Figure 10.3  Annual mortality improvement factors using projection Scale AA 184
Figure 10.4  Sample pension plan benefit payments 185
Figure 10.5  Defined benefit funding patterns over time. Panel A: Funded status for pensions sponsored by Standard & Poor’s 500 companies. Panel B: Funded status for 100 largest corporate pension plans in the United States 188

Figure 11.1  Percentage of quarters with 5 percent or more loss in year-over-year cash flow over 30-year horizon (nominal), by type of holding 210
Figure 11.2  Median annualized growth of cash flow over 30-year horizon (real), by type of holding 210
Figure 11.3  Median standard deviation of quarter-over-quarter change of balance over 30-year horizon, by type of holding 212

Figure 12.1  Projected pay-as-you-go rates for the Canada Pension Plan (CPP) 220
Figure 12.2  Projected pay-as-you-go rates versus legislated rates for the Canada Pension Plan (CPP) 223
Figure 12.3  Forecast of net liabilities and investment earnings for the Canada Pension Plan (CPP) 226
Figure 12.4  Factors affecting financial stability of the Canada Pension Plan (CPP) 227
Figure 12.5  Two levers governing strategic risk-taking at the Canada Pension Plan Investment Board (CPPIB) 229
Figure 12.6  The risk-budgeting framework of the Canada Pension Plan Investment Board (CPPIB) 234
Figure 13.1  Number of Voluntary Employee’s Beneficiary Associations (VEBAs) in the United States, 1976–2008 244


**List of Tables**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.1</td>
<td>Descriptive statistics for analysis sample</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.2</td>
<td>Distribution of mean sample characteristics by age group</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.3</td>
<td>Distribution of mean sample characteristics by annual salary</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.4</td>
<td>Multivariate OLS regression analysis of asset/salary ratio (ASR): dependent variable ln (asset/salary ratio)</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2.5</td>
<td>Multivariate ordered probit analysis of threshold asset/salary ratio (ASR): dependent variable threshold ASR</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>Sample descriptive statistics</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.2</td>
<td>Participant knowledge before and after the seminar: percentage of participants (number) answering each question correctly and the average number of correct answers to the 10 questions</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.3</td>
<td>Participant index of knowledge before and after seminar</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.4</td>
<td>Estimated coefficients from multivariate OLS knowledge equation: before and after seminar</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.5</td>
<td>Respondent retirement plans: before and after seminar</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.6</td>
<td>Estimated coefficients from multivariate OLS from planned age of retirement equation: before and after seminar</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.7</td>
<td>Participant evaluation of program</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3A.1</td>
<td>Seminars and participants in 2008</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1</td>
<td>Probability of survival (%) from age 65 to 80, 90, and 100: status quo projections</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2</td>
<td>Expected periods of long-term care need and expected costs for long-term care</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3</td>
<td>Wealth of middle-income, middle-aged households (ages 55–64)</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.1</td>
<td>Behavioral and market parameters employed in empirical analysis</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.2</td>
<td>Life-cycle saving rates and portfolio mixes for alternative labor income risk levels and social security replacement rates</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 6.3 Life-cycle saving rates and portfolio mixes for alternative levels of risk-aversion and social security replacement rates 117
Table 7.1 Characteristics of Americans aged 65 or older with pension income by demographic characteristics: 1998, 2003, and 2006 125
Table 7.2 Characteristics of Americans aged 65 or older who have worked for pay with pension income and median pension income amounts, by individual’s former employer characteristics: 2003 and 2006 127
Table 9.1 Singapore’s Minimum Sum Scheme (MSS) schedule: 2003–13 158
Table 9.2 Monthly nominal payouts for life annuities purchased at the Minimum Sum (MS) of $99,600 (2007; $ per month) 159
Table 9.3 Money’s worth ratios (MWRs) computed for Minimum Sum Scheme (MSS) life annuities 167
Table 9.4 Money’s worth ratios (MWRs) and adverse selection cost of Minimum Sum Scheme (MSS) annuities (nominal life annuities offered by private insurers under Central Provident Fund (CPF) plan; 2007) 168
Table 10.1 Life expectancy at birth and age 65 using various mortality assumptions 186
Table 10.2 Liability values using various mortality assumptions 186
Table 11.1 Descriptive statistics for empirical data analysis 207
Table 11.2 Summary of asset simulations over 30-year horizon 208
Table 11.3 Total real cash flow excluding ending balance 209
Table 11.4 Median ending portfolio balance (real) 211
Table 11.5 Median annual internal rates of return (real) for various holding periods 213
Table 11A.1 Payout rates and asset allocation patterns by age 214
Table 12.1 Internal rates of return on contributions: Canadian Pension Plan (CPP) (1910–2000) 219
Table 13.1 Funding for the General Motors (GM) 2007 Voluntary Employee Benefit Association (VEBA) 252