To Retire or Not?

Retirement Policy and Practice in Higher Education

Edited by
Robert L. Clark and P. Brett Hammond

Pension Research Council
The Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania

PENN
University of Pennsylvania Press
Philadelphia
Pension Research Council Publications

A complete list of books in the series appears at the back of this volume

Copyright © 2001 The Pension Research Council of the Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania
All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper
10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Published by University of Pennsylvania Press Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104–4011

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

To retire or not? : retirement policy and practice in higher education / edited by Robert L. Clark and P. Brett Hammond.
p. cm.
"Pension Research Council publications"—T.p. verso.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
LB2334 .T6 2001
331.25'2913781'20973—dc21 00-055218
Contributors

Robert L. Clark is Professor of Business Management and Professor of Economics at North Carolina State University. His research focuses on retirement behavior, company decisions to offer pension plans, the choice between defined benefit and defined contribution plans, the economic well-being of the elderly, and Social Security as well as international pensions. He is a Fellow of the Employee Benefit Research Institute and a member of the National Academy of Social Insurance, the American Economic Association, and the Gerontological Society of America. He earned a B.A. from Millsaps College and a Ph.D. from Duke University.

Ronald G. Ehrenberg is Irving M. Ives Professor of Industrial and Labor Relations and Economics at Cornell University. He is also Director of the Cornell Higher Education Research Institute and Co-director of Cornell’s Institute for Labor Market Policies. He is a research associate at the National Bureau of Economic Research and a member of the Executive Committee of the American Economic Association. From 1995 to 1998 he served as Cornell’s Vice President for Academic Programs, Planning, and Budgeting. He received a B.A. in mathematics from Harpur College (SUNY Binghamton) and a Ph.D. in economics from Northwestern University.

David Fontanella is Director of the Office of Institutional Research and Planning, and Senior Data Analyst in the Office of Institutional Research and Planning at Cornell University.

Linda S. Ghent teaches economics at Eastern Illinois University. She is a coauthor of several articles concerning retirement, retiree health insurance benefits, and other aging issues; her work has appeared in the Journal of Gerontology, Economic Development and Cultural Change, and other academic venues. She received a Ph.D. in economics from North Carolina State University.

P. Brett Hammond is Director of Corporate Projects for Teachers Insurance Annuity Association-College Retirement Equities Fund Investments.
Previously he served as Acting Executive Director of the behavioral and social sciences division at the National Academy of Sciences, Director of Academy Studies at the National Academy of Public Administration, and a faculty member at the University of California (Berkeley and Los Angeles). His research focuses on investments, pension economics, corporate governance, and higher education. He received A.B. degrees in economics and political science from the University of California at Santa Cruz and a Ph.D. in public policy from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

W. Lee Hansen is Professor Emeritus of Economics at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. Previously he taught at the University of California-Los Angeles and several European universities, was a Research Fellow at the Brookings Institution, served as a Senior Staff Economist for the President’s Council of Economic Advisers, and was a Fulbright scholar. His research explores topics in labor economics, the economics of education, and economic education. He holds undergraduate and master’s degrees from the University of Wisconsin-Madison and a Ph.D. in political economy from the Johns Hopkins University.

Karen C. Holden is Professor of Public Affairs and Consumer Science at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, a Fellow of the Gerontological Society of America, a member of the National Academy on Social Insurance, and an Associate of the Fellows program of the Employee Benefit Research Institute. She also sits on the Executive Committee of the Institute for Research on Poverty. Her research focuses on the economic welfare of the aged and explores how lifting the mandatory retirement age under the Age Discrimination in Employment Act of 1967 affected tenured faculty in higher education. She received a B.A. in economics from Barnard College and a Ph.D. in economics from the University of Pennsylvania.

John Keefe is President of Keefe Worldwide Information Services Inc. Previously he worked on Wall Street as an equity research analyst at two large investment banks and at leading public accounting firm. He earned a B.S. in accounting from Villanova University and an M.B.A. from the University of Pennsylvania’s Wharton School.

Juanita Kreps is a widely published author on labor and industrial markets, education, and other economic issues. She served as U.S. Secretary of Commerce and has been a board member of several Fortune 500 corporations along with national educational, research, and philanthropic organizations. Previously she taught economics and was Vice President at Duke University. A graduate of Berea College, she holds a Ph.D. in economics from Duke University.

Michael W. Matier is Director of Institutional Research and Planning at Cornell University. Previously he served as a Resource and Policy Analyst in the Planning and Budgeting Office of the University of Illinois. His re-
search examines faculty recruitment and retention, the persistence of undergraduates in science, space planning, and the nature and future of institutional research. He holds a Ph.D. in higher education administration from the University of Oregon.

Robert M. O’Neill is founding director of the Thomas Jefferson Center for the Protection of Free Expression and is on the University of Virginia’s law faculty. Previously he was President of the University of Virginia and President of the University of Wisconsin, and taught at the University of California, Indiana University, and the University of Wisconsin. He also served as law clerk to U.S. Supreme Court Justice William J. Brennan, Jr. His teaching and research, including numerous books and articles, focus on constitutional law of free speech and church and state, the first amendment and the arts, and cyberspace. He has chaired Committee A (Academic Freedom and Tenure) of the American Association of University Professors and served on two occasions as general counsel. He holds three degrees from Harvard University.

David L. Raish is the partner in charge of the employee benefits law practice at Ropes & Gray, a Boston-based law firm, where he concentrates on retirement plans, deferred compensation, and other employee benefit matters. His work focuses on tax-exempt employers including universities, health care organizations, and religious groups. He chairs the annual American Law Institute-American Bar Association conference on retirement and other benefit plans of tax-exempt and governmental employers. He is a graduate of Yale University and Harvard Law School.

Sharon P. Smith is Dean of the College of Business Administration at Fordham University. She previously worked as visiting senior research economist at Princeton University and as Vice President of AT&T. Her research focuses on employee compensation as well as higher education. She has written books on equal pay in the public sector and the impact of ending mandatory retirement for faculty in the arts and sciences.

Ellen Switkes is Assistant Vice President for Academic Advancement at the University of California, Office of the President, in Oakland, California, where she oversees academic personnel policy for the University of California’s nine campuses. She previously taught at the University of California, Santa Cruz. Her current responsibilities include faculty compensation, health science practice plans, severance compensation, grievance and layoff policies, and policy for academic collective bargaining. She holds a bachelor’s degree from Oberlin College and a Ph.D. in inorganic chemistry from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
Index

Academic labor market, vii, 1–20, 21–38, 65–80, 81–105, 148–66. See also Faculty; Retirement
Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA), 1, 9, 19, 21, 26, 39–64, 138–47, 149
Aging faculty, vii, 1–20, 65–80, 81–105, 123–27, 148–66. See also Age
American Association of Retired Persons (AARP), 92, 123
American Association of University Professors (AAUP), 123, 146
American Council on Education (ACE), 123
Annuities, 19–20
Ashenfelter, Orley, 6–8, 14, 20, 38, 64, 146
Association of American Universities (AAU), 123
Atkinson, Richard C., 5, 20
Baby boomers, 1, 65–80
Berkowitz, Monroe, 139, 146
Biggs, John, vii
Blacks, 32–34. See also Minorities; Race
Bowen, William G., 1, 5, 20
Brewer, Dominic J., 1, 20
Burkhauser, Richard, 32, 38
Card, David, 6–8, 14, 20, 38, 64, 91, 105, 146
Carnegie classification system, 71–74, 138–47
Clark, Robert L., 1–20, 21–38, 62, 139, 146, 154, 159–60, 165
Colleges, 1–5; costs, 40–41, 81–105. See also Academic labor market; Higher education
Conference Committee Report on the Higher Education Amendments of 1998, 45, 49–51
Cornell University, 12, 20, 81–105. See also Window plans
Costa, Dora L., 128, 137
Costs of delaying retirement, 1–20, 88–89, 138–47, 157. See also Delayed retirement
Death benefit plan. See Employee Retirement Income Security Act
Deferred compensation, 56–57, 95–96
Defined benefit pension, 7–8, 32, 40–42, 81–105, 106–21, 151. See also Pension
Defined contribution pension, 7–8, 32, 40–42, 81–105, 151. See also Pension
Delayed retirement, vii, 2–3, 29–30. See also Academic labor market; Costs of delaying retirement; Early retirement; Employment; Retirement age
Demographic trends, 16–20, 81–105, 138–47. See also Aging; Baby boomers
DeViney, Stanley, 165
DiGiovanni, Nicholas, Jr., 139, 146
Disability benefit plan, 61–62. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act; Welfare benefit plan
Duke University, vii, 7–8, 12, 21–38
172 Index

Early retirement (continued)
Academic labor market; Employment; Retirement; Window plans
Earnings, 31–33, 95–97, 129–32
Ehrenberg, Ronald G., 12, 62, 81–105, 146, 157, 165
Ekerdt, David J., 164–65
Emeritus faculty, 93
Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA), 9–11, 53–64, 74
Employment: older faculty, 1–20, 21–38, 57–61, 65–80, 81–105, 106–21, 122–27, 138–47. See also Academic labor markets; Discrimination; Retirement; Work
Endowment, 90–91
Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC), 10, 40–41, 62–64
Expectations about retirement, 79, 148–66
Fair Labor Standards Act, 40–41
Federal income taxes and pensions, 56–57
Finkelstein, Martin J., 1, 5, 20
Finkin, Matthew W., 139, 146
Fontanella, David, 12, 81–105, 146, 165
403(b) plans, 107. See also Defined contribution; Pension
Gates, Susan M., 1, 20
Gender. See Sex
Geographic differences in retirement, 73–74
Ghent, Linda S., 7, 21–38, 62, 146, 165
Goldman, Charles M., 1, 20
Gustman, Alan L., 164–65
Hammond, P. Brett, 1–20, 21–38, 62, 139, 146
Hansen, W. Lee, 15, 146, 148–65
Harper, Loretta, 38
Harsanyi, J. C., 134, 137
Health, 21; insurance, 41, 53, 61–62, 76–77, 107, 155. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act
Highly compensated employees, 54–55. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act
Hiring patterns. See Employment
Holden, Karen C., 15, 148–65
Honig, Marjorie, 164–65
Insurance. See Health insurance; Pension; Social security
Internal Revenue Code, 56–57, 111–12
Jobs. See Seniority; Tenure
Keeffe, John, 10–11, 14, 62, 65–80, 128–37, 135, 161, 165
Kim, Seongsu, 118, 121
Kosloski, Karl, 165
Kotlikoff, Laurence J., 32, 38
Kreps, Juanita, vii, 7, 21–38, 62, 146, 165
Kreuger, Alan B., 91, 105
Lederman, Douglas, 92, 105
Legal constraints, 8–9, 39–64
Liberal arts. See private colleges and universities
Life expectancy, 21
Life insurance, 77
Lump sum payments, 11, 46–53, 66–67, 81–105
Management pensions, 54–56, 148–66. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act
Matier, Michael W., 12, 81–105, 146, 165
Medicare, 76
Medigap insurance, 76
Mellon, Andrew J. Foundation, 141
Mitchell, Olivia S., 165
Mobility, 65–80. See also Employment; Tenure
Morgenstern, Oscar, 147
Mortality, 21. See also Life expectancy
Myers, Daniel, 32, 38
National Center for Education Statistics, 65, 74–75, 79–80
National Commission on the Cost of Higher Education, 40, 64
National Research Council, 1–2, 6, 20, 37–38, 40, 64, 105, 123, 125, 127, 141, 145–46, 160–61
Neumark, David, 91, 105
Normal retirement. See Employment; Retirement; Work
North Carolina, 21–38, 160
North Carolina State University, vii, 7–8, 12, 21–38
Older Workers’ Benefit Protection Act, 43
O’Neil, Robert M., 14, 17, 122–27, 165
Palmer, Bruce A., 67, 79
Paths to retirement, 65–80, 81–105, 122–27, 148–66. See also Employment; Retirement; Work
Pencavel, John, 13, 20, 70, 79–80, 121, 134–45, 137
Pension plan type. See Defined benefit; Defined contribution
Pension Research Council, vii
Pitts, Melinda, 38
Postretirement activities, 117–18
Pratt, Henry J., 147
Productivity of faculty, 22–24, 123–24
Private colleges and universities, 4–5, 39–64, 71, 74, 142–43
Public colleges and universities, 9, 39–64, 71, 74, 106, 142–43
Quality of educational programs, 121
Quinn, Joseph, 32, 38
Race, 31–33. See also Minorities
Raish, David L., 8–9, 39–64, 125, 237
Recall patterns, 117–18
Replacement rate, 7–8, 67
Rees, Albert, 2, 20, 105, 146
Religiously affiliated colleges and universities, 53–59. See also Private colleges and universities; Public colleges and universities
Research universities, 2–3, 74–76, 81–105
Retiree health insurance. See Health insurance
Review of faculty performance, 5–6
Rosovksy, Henry, 139, 147
Safe harbor: legislation, 10–11, 18, 39–64; plans, 30–35. See also Age Discrimination in Employment Act; Discrimination
Salary, 31–33, 61–62, 95–97, 145. See also Deferred compensation; Earnings
Schuster, Jack H., 1, 5, 20
Seal, Robert K., 1, 5, 20
Service and pensions, 39–64, 81–105
Severance payments, 10–11, 46–48. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act
Sex, 31–33
Size of school, 74–75
Smith, Sharon P., 2, 14, 20, 105, 138–47, 165
Social security benefits, 107
Sosa, Julie Ann, 1, 5, 20

Index 173
174 Index

State: age discrimination laws, 57–56; colleges and universities, 39–64, 106–22, 122–27
State University of New York, 105
Steinmeier, Thomas L., 165
Stock, 17–18
Supreme Court, 41
Surplus faculty, 1–2, 39–40, 65–80, 122–27. See also Academic labor market; Employment; Retirement
Switkes, Ellen, 13, 70, 79–80, 105, 106–21, 134–43, 137, 156, 165
Tax issues, 56–57, 85, 159. See also Internal Revenue Code
Teachers Insurance Annuities Association/College Retirement Equities Fund (TIAA-CREF), vii, 65, 84, 104, 150–51, 154, 157, 161, 164; Institute, vii; participants, 7
Temporary retirement incentive. See Phased retirement; Lump sum; Window plan
Tenure, 1–20, 39–64, 65–80, 81–105, 122–27. See also Aging faculty; Retirement; Seniority; Work
Top hat plans, 54–56. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act

University: staffing patterns, 1–20, 82–105, 122–27. See also Financial impact; Higher education; Human resource policy; Retirement; names of individual institutions
University of California, 12, 70, 74, 79, 106–23, 134–35. See also Window plans
University of Chicago, 90
University of Florida, 122, 125–27
University of Maine, 122
University of Michigan, 123
University of North Carolina, 7–8, 12, 21–38, 160–61
University of Virginia, 12, 14, 122–27
University of Wisconsin, 12, 14, 122–27
U.S. Congress, 2–5, 91–94, 123, 150, 165
U.S. Court of Appeals, 45
U.S. Department of Education, 64, 80, 71, 137, 143, 146–47, 164
U.S. Department of Labor, 60–61, 149, 165
Von Neumann, John, 147
Wascher, William L., 91, 105
Welfare benefit plan, 61–62. See also Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974
Window plans, 10–11, 39–64, 65–80, 128–47; Cornell University, 12; University of California, 13–14, 107–21
Wise, David A., 32, 38
Women. See Sex
Work: at older ages, 1–20, 21–38, 65–80, 107–21; differences by sex, 31–33. See also Academic labor market; Employment; Retirement age
Yale University, 90, 124
The Pension Research Council

The Pension Research Council of the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania is an organization committed to generating debate on key policy issues affecting pensions and other employee benefits. The Council sponsors interdisciplinary research on the entire range of private and social retirement security and related benefit plans in the United States and around the world. It seeks to broaden understanding of these complex arrangements through basic research into their economic, social, legal, actuarial, and financial foundations. Members of the Advisory Board of the Council, appointed by the Dean of the Wharton School, are leaders in the employee benefits field, and they recognize the essential role of social security and other public sector income maintenance programs while sharing a desire to strengthen private sector approaches to economic security.

Executive Director


Senior Partners

AARP
Actuarial Sciences Associates, Inc.
Buck Consultants, Inc.
Morgan Stanley Dean Witter & Co.
Mutual of America Life Insurance Co.
PricewaterhouseCoopers
SEI Investments, Inc.
State Street Corporation
The Vanguard Group
Institutional Members

Employee Benefit Research Institute
Ford Motor Company
Hay Group
India Life Pension Services Limited
Instituto Cultural de Seguridade Social
Investment Company Institute
John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.
J.P. Morgan Investment Management, Inc.
JRT Research, Ltd.
KPMG Peat Marwick LLP
Loomis, Sayles & Company, L.P.
Merck & Co., Inc.
MetLife
New York Life Insurance Company
The Principal Financial Group
The Prudential Insurance Company
The Segal Company
TIAA-CREF
ULLICO
VALIC

Advisory Board

Vincent Amoroso, F.S.A., Principal, Deloitte Touche, Washington, DC
Gary W. Anderson, Executive Director, Texas Municipal Retirement System, Austin, TX
David S. Blitzstein, Director, United Food & Commercial Workers International Union, Washington, DC
Marshall Blume, Howard Butcher Professor of Finance and Director, Rodney L. White Center for Financial Research, The Wharton School, Philadelphia, PA
Zvi Bodie, Professor of Finance, Boston University, Boston, MA
Michael S. Gordon, Esq., Law Offices of Michael S. Gordon, Washington, DC
P. Brett Hammond, Director of Corporate Projects, TIAA-CREF, New York, NY
Judith F. Mazo, Senior Vice President and Director of Research, The Segal Company, Washington, DC
Alicia H. Munnell, Peter F. Drucker Chair in Management Sciences, School of Management, Boston College, Boston, MA
Robert J. Myers, F.S.A., International Consultant on Social Security, Silver Spring, MD
Anna M. Rappaport, F.S.A., Managing Director, William M. Mercer, Inc., Chicago, IL
Jerry S. Rosenbloom, Frederick H. Ecker Professor of Insurance and Risk Management, The Wharton School, Philadelphia, PA
Sylvester J. Schieber, Vice President and Director of Research and Information Center, The Wyatt Company, Washington, DC
Richard B. Stanger, National Director, Employee Benefits Services, Price Waterhouse LLP, New York, NY
Marc M. Twinney, Jr., F.S.A., Consultant, Bloomfield Hills, MI
Michael Useem, Professor of Management and Sociology, The Wharton School, Philadelphia, PA
Jack L. VanDerhei, Professor of Risk and Insurance, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA
Paul H. Wenz, F.S.A., Second Vice President and Actuary, The Principal Financial Group, Des Moines, IA
Stephen Zeldes, Benjamin Rosen Professor of Economics and Finance, Columbia University, New York, NY
Recent Pension Research Council Publications

More information about the Pension Research Council is available at the web site: http://prc.wharton.upenn.edu/prc/prc.html