

Securing Employer-Based Pensions: An International Perspective

Pension Research Council Publications

A complete listing of PRC publications appears in the back of this volume.

Securing Employer- Based Pensions

An International Perspective

Edited by Zvi Bodie, Olivia S. Mitchell,
and John A. Turner

Published by

The Pension Research Council

The Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania

and

University of Pennsylvania Press

Philadelphia

© Copyright 1996 by the Pension Research Council
All rights reserved
Printed in the United States of America

The chapters in this volume are based on papers presented at the May 5 and 6, 1994 Pension Research Council Symposium entitled "Securing Employer-Based Pensions: An International Perspective."

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Securing employer-based pensions: an international perspective /
edited by Zvi Bodie, Olivia S. Mitchell, and John Turner.
p. cm.

Earlier versions of these papers presented at a conference in May 1994.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-8122-3334-4

1. Pensions—Congresses. 2. Old age pensions—Congresses.
3. Pension trusts—Congresses. 4. Social security—Congresses.
I. Bodie, Zvi. II. Mitchell, Olivia S. III. Turner, John A. (John
Andrew), 1949 July 9— IV. Wharton School. Pension Research
Council.

HD7090.S36 1996

331.25'2—dc20

95-37311

CIP

Pension Research Council

Executive Director

Olivia S. Mitchell, International Foundation of Employee Benefit Plans Professor, Department of Insurance and Risk Management, The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA

Institutional Members

Bankers Trust Company
Buck Consultants
Ford Motor Company
Hay/Huggins Company
Instituto Cultural de Seguridade Social
John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Company
JP Morgan Investment Management, Inc.
KPMG Peat Marwick
Loomis, Sayles & Company, LP
Merck & Company, Inc.
Metropolitan Life Insurance Company
Mutual of America Life Insurance Company
Northwestern Mutual Life Insurance Company
Price Waterhouse LLP
The Principal Financial Group
The Prudential Foundation
SEI Corporation
TIAA-CREF
Variable Annuity Life Insurance Company
William M. Mercer Companies, Inc.
The Wyatt Company

Executive Board

Vincent Amoroso, F.S.A., Principal, KPMG Peat Marwick, Washington, DC
Marshall Blume, Howard Butcher Professor of Finance and Director, Rodney L. White Center for Financial Research, The Wharton School, Philadelphia, PA
Zvi Bodie, Visiting Professor of Business Administration, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA
Michael S. Gordon, Esq., Law Offices of Michael S. Gordon, Washington, DC

vi Pension Research Council

William Madden, Senior Vice President, Capital Markets Research, SEI Corporation, Malvern, PA

Judith F. Mazo, Senior Vice President and Director of Research, The Segal Company, Washington, DC

Alicia H. Munnell, Assistant Secretary, Office of Economic Policy, U.S. Department of the Treasury, Washington, DC

Robert J. Myers, F.S.A., International Consultant on Social Security, Silver Spring, MD
George J. Pantos, Esq., Partner, Vedder, Price, Kaufman, Kammholz & Day, Washington, DC

Richard Prosten, Director, Washington Office, Amalgamated Life Insurance / Amalgamated Bank of New York, Washington, DC

Anna M. Rappaport, F.S.A., Managing Director, William M. Mercer, Inc., Chicago, IL

Jerry S. Rosenbloom, Frederick H. Ecker Professor of Insurance and Risk Management, The Wharton School, Philadelphia, PA

Sylvester J. Schieber, Vice President and Director of Research and Information Center, The Wyatt Company, Washington, DC

Ray Schmitt, Social Legislation Specialist, Congressional Research Service, Library of Congress, Washington, DC

Richard B. Stanger, National Director, Employee Benefits Services, Price Waterhouse LLP, New York, NY

Marc M. Twinney, Jr., F.S.A., Consultant, Bloomfield Hills, MI

Jack L. VanDerhei, Associate Professor of Risk and Insurance, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA

Paul H. Wenz, F.S.A., Second Vice President and Actuary, The Principal Financial Group, Des Moines, IA

Howard Young, F.S.A., Consultant, Livonia, MI

Pension Research Council

The Pension Research Council of The Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania is an organization committed to generating debate on key policy issues affecting pensions and other employee benefits. The Council sponsors interdisciplinary research on the entire range of private and social retirement security and related benefit plans in the United States and around the world and seeks to broaden public understanding of these complex arrangements through basic research into their social, economic, legal, actuarial, and financial foundations. Members of the Executive Board of Council, appointed by the Dean of The Wharton School, are leaders in the employee benefits field, and though they recognize the essential role of social security and other public sector income maintenance programs, they share a strong desire to strengthen private sector approaches to economic security.

Contents

| | |
|---|------------|
| Preface | xi |
| 1. Pension Security in an Aging World | 1 |
| <i>Zvi Bodie and Olivia S. Mitchell</i> | |
| Glossary of Terms | 29 |
| I. Pensions in Developed Nations | 31 |
| 2. Occupational Pension Provision in the United Kingdom | 33 |
| <i>Christopher D. Daykin</i> | |
| Comments by Anthony M. Santomero | 69 |
| 3. Pension Financial Security in Germany | 73 |
| <i>Peter Ahrend</i> | |
| Comments by Lucy apRoberts | 105 |
| Comments by Marc M. Twinney | 114 |
| 4. Private Pension Plans in Japan | 121 |
| <i>Noriyasu Watanabe</i> | |
| Comments by Robert L. Clark | 143 |
| II. Pensions in Emerging Economies | 149 |
| 5. Mandatory Saving Schemes: Are They an Answer to the Old Age Security Problem? | 151 |
| <i>Estelle James and Dimitri Vittas</i> | |
| Comments by Alan J. Auerbach | 183 |
| Comments by Donald S. Grubbs, Jr. | 187 |

x Contents

| | |
|---|------------|
| 6. Private Pension Systems in Transition Economies <i>John A. Turner and David M. Rajnes</i> | 193 |
| III. Instruments of Pension Policy | 211 |
| 7. The Taxation of Private Pensions <i>Andrew Dilnot</i> | 213 |
| Comments by Angela E. Chang | 232 |
| Comments by Sylvester J. Schieber | 235 |
| 8. An International Comparison of the Financing of Occupational Pensions <i>E. Philip Davis</i> | 244 |
| Comments by Marshall E. Blume | 282 |
| 9. The Government's Role in Insuring Pensions <i>James E. Pesando</i> | 286 |
| Comments by Carolyn L. Weaver | 306 |
| Comments by Dallas L. Salisbury | 312 |
| Contributors | 317 |
| Index | 325 |

Preface

As the world's population ages, pensions will be sought by millions as the mainstay of old age retirement income. This is a book about how to increase pension security in the international context. The contributors to this volume take a serious look at both public and private pensions, evaluating what they do well and what they do poorly in both developed and developing nations. This volume also seeks to help policymakers and practitioners look ahead, offering numerous suggestions for better pension designs in the future.

As shown in this book, sensible tax, insurance and funding policy, and investment management and actuarial oversight are central to building and maintaining a successful pension system. The ways in which these factors interact are traced across a variety of institutional environments, each of which generates its own pension system. Contributors to the volume illustrate the range of options as they vary across cultures, from Japan to Germany, and the United Kingdom to Canada. In addition, pensions in emerging economies offer both opportunities and cautionary lessons about how to secure retirement income in the new global economic order.

The most important contribution of this book is that it offers new perspectives and evaluation tools, which readers may then employ to examine their own as well as other pension systems. Views from government actuaries, lawyers, corporate benefits managers, economists, and policymakers make it an invaluable collection of international and interdisciplinary insights, supplying an unusually rich combination of facts and observations about pensions around the world. The book should be required reading for all managers and policymakers designing pension systems for a global workforce.

This volume owes its existence to the Pension Research Council Executive Board, who enthusiastically supported the concept of an international pension security theme for its May 1994 conference, at which

earlier versions of these papers and discussions were presented. Sponsorship for the conference was generously provided by the United States Department of Labor and the World Bank, as well as the Institutional Members of the Pension Research Council. On behalf of the Pension Research Council at The Wharton School, I thank the many contributors and the various institutions supporting the high-quality research leading to this volume.

OLIVIA S. MITCHELL
Executive Director
Pension Research Council